

**MINUTES  
CITIZENS' LAW ENFORCEMENT REVIEW BOARD MEETING  
February 14, 2023**

**Attachment A**

<b>Open session was convened via the Zoom Platform at 5:38 p.m.</b>	
<b>Agenda Item</b>	<b>Discussion</b>
<b>Roll Call</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ All Board Members were present except for Dr. R. Lee Brown and Tim Ware</li> </ul>
<b>Swear In New CLERB Member</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Swear in of new Board member will happen during next month's meeting.</li> </ul>
<b>Public Comments</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Members of the Public addressed comments to the Board.</li> </ul>
<b>Minutes Approval</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ No revisions made to the January 11<sup>th</sup> meeting minutes. Votes to approve were as follows:               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Eileen Delaney: Yes</li> <li>▪ MaryAnne Pintar: Yes</li> <li>▪ Pastor Robert Spriggs: Yes</li> <li>▪ Andrew Hayes: Yes</li> <li>▪ Nadia Kean-Ayub: Yes</li> <li>▪ Bonnie Kenk: Yes</li> <li>▪ Ariana Federico Mondragon: Yes</li> <li>▪ Gary Wilson: Yes</li> <li>▪ Motion carried 8-0</li> </ul> </li> <li>▪ No revisions made to the January 31<sup>st</sup> meeting minutes. Votes to approve were as follows:               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Eileen Delaney: Yes</li> <li>▪ MaryAnne Pintar: Yes</li> <li>▪ Pastor Robert Spriggs: Yes</li> <li>▪ Andrew Hayes: Yes</li> <li>▪ Nadia Kean-Ayub: Yes</li> <li>▪ Bonnie Kenk: Yes</li> <li>▪ Ariana Federico Mondragon: Yes</li> <li>▪ Gary Wilson: Yes</li> <li>▪ Motion carried 8-0</li> </ul> </li> </ul>
<b>Executive Officers Report</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Staff have been working to ensure virtual capability is flawless when we go back to in-person meetings on March 21.</li> <li>▪ Staff have been diligently working on the 2022 Annual Report, scheduled to be presented to CLERB on March 21 and the BOS the next week.</li> <li>▪ Paul Parker chaired a NACOLE subcommittee pertaining to outcome vs. outputs for civilian oversight stakeholders and participated in the outcome vs. outputs for civilian oversight investigators.</li> <li>▪ Investigative Workload and Classification Report for January 2023 (<i>Attachment B</i>)               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Eleven new cases were reported in January.</li> <li>▪ At the end of January there were 97 open cases.                   <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ There were 30 open death cases.                       <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ CLERB staff has materials for 10, awaiting materials on 20.</li> <li>▪ There were no new SDSD death cases reported in January.</li> </ul> </li> <li>▪ There were eight open uses of force resulting in great bodily injury.                       <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ One is on tonight's agenda.</li> <li>▪ CLERB staff has materials for the other seven.</li> </ul> </li> <li>▪ There were five open discharges of firearms.                       <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ One is on tonight's agenda.</li> <li>▪ CLERB staff has materials for one other.</li> </ul> </li> <li>▪ There were no open uses of force at protests/First Amendment-protected events.</li> </ul> </li> <li>▪ Case Progress and Status Reports (<i>Attachment C</i>)</li> </ul> </li> </ul>

**MINUTES  
CITIZENS' LAW ENFORCEMENT REVIEW BOARD MEETING  
February 14, 2023**

**Attachment A**

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Mr. Parker discussed the two reports: “CLERB Reports by Due Date” and “CLERB Reports Due by Case Number.”</li> <li>▪ Executive Officer Correspondence to Full CLERB (<i>Attachment D</i>) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Nine emails containing 25 total media articles/releases.</li> </ul> </li> <li>▪ Policy Recommendation Pending Responses – 17-SDSD, four – Probation</li> <li>▪ Policy Recommendation Responses – 1-SDSD (<i>Attachment E</i>), 1- Probation (<i>Attachment F</i>)</li> <li>▪ Sustained Finding Pending Responses <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ 20-050 / Bills (Death)</li> <li>▪ 21-069 / Rodriguez (Death)</li> </ul> </li> <li>▪ Sustained Finding Response None</li> </ul>
<b>Board Chair’s Report</b>	<p>Chair Eileen Delaney encouraged Board members to participate in Detention Facility tours and arrange them with Mr. Parker and Sgt. Tingley. Chair Delaney thanked members of the public for attending as well as the Sheriff’s Dept., all Board Members, Probation Dept., and CLERB staff.</p>
<b>New Business</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a) Continuance of Teleconferencing Meeting option Pursuant to Government Code Section 54953 (e) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Will return to In Person meetings beginning in March under state law.</li> <li>▪ No vote is required.</li> </ul> </li> <li>b) Adoption of New CLERB Logo (<i>Attachment G</i>) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Administrative Analyst Nawras Hakak presented two proposed CLERB Logo options to the Board.</li> <li>▪ Board members shared thoughts and took a vote for logo preferences.</li> <li>▪ Members of the Public addressed comments to the Board.</li> <li>▪ Motion to adopt Logo B; Votes to approve were as follows: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Eileen Delaney: No</li> <li>▪ MaryAnne Pintar: No</li> <li>▪ Pastor Robert Spriggs: Yes</li> <li>▪ Andrew Hayes: No</li> <li>▪ Nadia Kean-Ayub: No</li> <li>▪ Bonnie Kenk: Yes</li> <li>▪ Ariana Federico Mondragon: No</li> <li>▪ Gary Wilson: No</li> <li>▪ Motion failed: 6-2</li> </ul> </li> <li>▪ Motion to adopt Logo A; Votes to approve were as follows: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Eileen Delaney: Yes</li> <li>▪ MaryAnne Pintar: Yes</li> <li>▪ Pastor Robert Spriggs: No</li> <li>▪ Andrew Hayes: No</li> <li>▪ Nadia Kean-Ayub: Yes</li> <li>▪ Bonnie Kenk: No</li> <li>▪ Ariana Federico Mondragon: Yes</li> <li>▪ Gary Wilson: Yes</li> <li>▪ Motion failed: 5-3</li> </ul> </li> <li>▪ Board decided to bring new CLERB logo to the next meeting.. Votes to approve as follows: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Eileen Delaney: Yes</li> <li>▪ MaryAnne Pintar: Yes</li> <li>▪ Pastor Robert Spriggs: Yes</li> <li>▪ Andrew Hayes: Yes</li> <li>▪ Nadia Kean-Ayub: Yes</li> <li>▪ Bonnie Kenk: Yes</li> <li>▪ Ariana Federico Mondragon: Yes</li> <li>▪ Gary Wilson: Yes</li> </ul> </li> </ul> </li> </ul>

**MINUTES  
CITIZENS' LAW ENFORCEMENT REVIEW BOARD MEETING  
February 14, 2023**

**Attachment A**

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Motion carried: 8-0</li> </ul> <p>c) One-Year Update to Recommendations in California State Auditor Report 2021-109 (Attachment H)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Mr. Parker reviewed the six recommendations attached.</li> <li>▪ Members of the Public addressed comments to the Board.</li> </ul> <p>d) Receive Public Input on Updated Proposed Revisions to CLERB's Rules and Regulations (Attachment I)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Board members shared input and questions on Attachment I</li> <li>▪ Members of the Public addressed comments to the Board.</li> <li>▪ Group decided to schedule a meeting to include Mr. Parker, Bonnie Kenk and Andrew Hayes. The meeting's purpose is to meet and determine how the Special Meeting will be conducted.</li> <li>▪ Group decided to make a motion to have a Special Meeting to review proposed revisions during the 3/21/23 Board meeting. Votes to approve as follows: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Eileen Delaney: Yes</li> <li>▪ MaryAnne Pintar: Yes</li> <li>▪ Pastor Robert Spriggs: Yes</li> <li>▪ Andrew Hayes: Yes</li> <li>▪ Nadia Kean-Ayub: Yes</li> <li>▪ Bonnie Kenk: Yes</li> <li>▪ Ariana Federico Mondragon: Yes</li> <li>▪ Gary Wilson: Yes</li> </ul> </li> <li>▪ Motion carried: 8-0</li> </ul>
<b>Unfinished Business</b>	<p>a) Update: Authority for the Executive Officer to Work with County Staff to Pursue Legislation and/or to Add a Policy to the County Legislative Program in Support of Increased Transparency in Civilian Oversight of Peace Officers and Custodial Officers</p> <p>b) Update: Authority for the Executive Officer to Work with County Staff to Request that the County Board of Supervisors Expand CLERB's Jurisdiction to Include All Sheriff's Department Personnel and Personnel Involved in Providing Medical Care in County Detention Facilities</p>
<b>Board Member Comments</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Mary Anne Pintar expressed condolences to the families present at the CLERB meeting for the loss of their loved ones. Vice Chair Pintar also expressed that she has respectfully asked questions to get clarity and expects respectful answers in return.</li> <li>▪ Nadia Kean-Ayub requested for Sgt. Tingley and Lieutenant Greenwald to come back to the next Board meeting clarification on the SDSD's Transgender Incarcerated Person P&amp;P.</li> </ul>
<b>Sherriff/Probation Liaison Query</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Sgt. Tingley provided responses to questions from last month's Board meeting (reference CLERB meeting video for specific questions and answers).</li> <li>▪ Update on Sustain Letters and Policy Recommendations.</li> <li>▪ Sgt. Tingley encouraged all Board members to take a tour of the jail facilities to have an understand of jail operations.</li> <li>▪ Members of the Public addressed comments to the Board.</li> </ul>
<b>Open session was adjourned at 7:44 p.m.</b>	
<b>Closed session was convened at 7:53 p.m.</b>	
<b>Closed Session</b>	<p>a) PUBLIC EMPLOYEE DISCIPLINE/DISMISSAL/RELEASE</p> <p><b>Discussion &amp; Consideration of Complaints &amp; Reports:</b> Pursuant to Government code Section 54957 to hear complaints or charges brought against Sheriff or Probation employees by a citizen (unless the employee requests a public session). Notice to government Code Section 54957 for deliberations regarding consideration of subject officer discipline recommendation (if applicable).</p>


**MINUTES**  
**CITIZENS' LAW ENFORCEMENT REVIEW BOARD MEETING**  
*February 14, 2023*

**Attachment A**

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>▪ <b>CASE NO.</b> 21-102/ROJAS 22-032/HAVINS 22-039/LOZANO 22-101/HURST 22-158/MEYER 22-162/PATTON</li></ul>
<b>Closed session was adjourned at 8:06 p.m.</b>	

  
PAUL R. PARKER III  
Executive Officer

*Minutes prepared by Valeria Zagal, Administrative Secretary III*

  
ROBERT SPRIGGS, JR.  
Secretary to the Board