



COUNTY OF SAN DIEGO

Leon L. Williams San Diego County Human Relations Commission

Meeting Minutes

October 11, 2023, 5:30 PM – 7:30 PM

- 1) Call to Order
 - Meeting called to order at 5:49pm
- 2) Roll Call & Introductions
 - **Present:**
Cinnamon Clark, Sarah Farouq, David Garcias, Taha Hassane, Adeem Ismaeil, George Khoury, Nicole Murray Ramirez, Ellen Nash, Fabienne Perlov
 - **Late:**
Angela Elliot-Santos, Eleanor Evans
 - **Excused Absences:**
Kate Clark, Estela De Los Rios, Rodney Fowler, Jordan Harrison, Gina Roberts, Joseph Allen Ruanto-Ramirez, Milan Shah, David Vance
 - **Departed Early:**
Nicole Murray Ramirez
- 3) Land Acknowledgement
 - Mr. Strong read a script recognizing and acknowledging Indigenous people that called (what is now) San Diego County home for a millennia.
- 4) Public Comment: Opportunity for members of the public to speak to the Commission on any subject matter within the Commission's jurisdiction, but not an item on today's agenda.
 - Francine Maxwell spoke to Commissioners regarding the reason why the HRC came about and suggested removing Leon L. Williams from the HRC name.
 - Chair Nash condemns the innocent loss of lives in the Middle East. Reminds everyone to focus on the nominations for the remainder of the meeting.
- 5) Nominate and Appoint Commission Nominated Seats
 - a) Commission will consider applications and make motions to appoint members for up to 3 open HRC Nominated Seats.
 - Mr. Strong read out the nomination process as outlined in the HRC Memo (attached), public comment, then discussion.
 - Applications were sent to the Commission on September 27, 2023.

- Chair Nash thanks all applicants for applying and coming to today’s meeting.
- Public Comment:
 - Adele Fassano spoke regarding her application.
 - Rabbi Devorah Marcus spoke regarding her application.
 - Darwin Fishman spoke regarding his application.
 - Smith Sirisakorn spoke regarding her application.
- Chair Nash advised the commission about current Bylaws requirements.
 - Mr. Strong: Requirements – Majority vote for each nominee that has been brought forward by a Motion.
 - 3 vacant seats
- Commissioner Perlov motions for Rabbi Marcus, seconded by Commissioner Murray Ramirez.
 - Vice-Chair Evans is in favor of Rabbi Marcus.
 - Commissioner C. Clark is in favor of Rabbi Marcus.
 - Commissioner Hassane will every candidate be motioned and discussed?
 - Chair Nash: Yes, let’s be consistent.
 - Chair Nash is in favor of Rabbi Marcus.
 - Commissioner Garcias asks Rabbi Marcus about her interfaith experience?
 - Rabbi Marcus: Shared background of interfaith working from when she lived in New York.
 - Commissioner Farouq asks have you worked with the Palestinian community?
 - Rabbi Marcus: In what context? I have lived and worked in Israel and have friends that are Palestinian. My friend group is very diverse that included an array of Palestinians who identify as Israeli-Palestinian and others that do not.
 - Commissioner Farouq comment: There is a genocide currently happening.
 - Chair Nash calls Commissioner Farouq out of order.
- Chair Nash calls the Vote.
 - Vote:
 - Clark, C – Aye
 - Clark, K – Absent
 - De Los Rios - Absent
 - Elliot-Santos – Aye
 - Evans – Aye
 - Farouq – Abstain
 - Fowler Sr. – Absent
 - Garcias – Aye
 - Harrison - Absent
 - Hassane – Abstain
 - Hodges – Abstain
 - Ismaeil – Abstain
 - Khoury – Abstain
 - Murray Ramirez – Aye
 - Nash – Aye
 - Perlov - Aye
 - Roberts – Absent
 - Ruanto-Ramirez – Absent
 - Shah - Absent
 - Vance – Absent

- Ayes: 7
 - Nays: 0
 - Abstain: 5

- Motion Fails.

- Commissioner Murray Ramirez: Asian Pacific Islander community is also missing representation in the HRC. We need to focus on Jewish and Asian Pacific Islander community on this board.
- Commissioner Evans asks for clarification on number of votes necessary to pass a motion.
 - Mr. Strong: 11 votes needed. Based on total number of commissioners on HRC, and not commissioners present in today's meeting.
- Commissioner Hassane motions for Darwin Fishman, seconded by Commissioner Khoury.
 - Commissioner C. Clark is in favor of Darwin Fishman.
 - Commissioner Khoury is in favor of Darwin Fishman.
 - Vice-Chair has concerns of Darwin Fishman's previous writings and not wanting to be a subject of future writings.
 - Commissioner Hassane is in favor of Darwin Fishman.
 - Commissioner Perlov asks Commissioner Hassane if Mr. Fishman is a member of *indiscernible*.
 - Commissioner Hassane: Unsure, but he is a member of the San Diego Racial Justice or something similar.
 - Darwin Fishman: His publications are about Black Youth and Civil Engagement, he's never written about HRC, only worked with HRC's. Is not a member of Progressive Jewish/ Jewish Voices. Is a co-founder of the Racial Justice Coalition of San Diego, a member of the NAACP and BAPAC.
 - Commissioner Farouq is in favor of Darwin Fishman.
 - Commissioner Perlov mentions the prioritization of the Israeli/Palestinian conflict. It is problematic.
 - Chair Nash calls Commissioner Perlov comments off topic.
 - Chair Nash calls the Vote.
 - Vote:
 - Clark, C – Aye
 - Clark, K – Absent
 - De Los Rios - Absent
 - Elliot-Santos – Aye
 - Evans – Nay
 - Farouq – Aye
 - Fowler Sr. – Absent
 - Garcias – Aye
 - Harrison - Absent
 - Hassane – Aye
 - Hodges – Aye
 - Ismaeil – Aye
 - Khoury – Aye
 - Murray Ramirez – Left
 - Nash – Nay
 - Perlov - Nay
 - Roberts – Absent

- Ruanto-Ramirez – Absent
- Shah - Absent
- Vance – Absent

- Ayes: 8
- Nays: 3
- Abstain: 0

- Motion Fails

- Commissioner Khoury asks if Amina Idoui could fit in the Youth category (16-24)? If so motions for Amina Idoui, seconded by Commissioner Hassane.
 - Amina Idoui introduced herself (previously had technical difficulties and unable to do so in Public Comment section).
 - Chair Nash calls the Vote.
 - Vote:
 - Clark, C – Aye
 - Clark, K – Absent
 - De Los Rios - Absent
 - Elliot-Santos – Aye
 - Evans – Nay
 - Farouq – Aye
 - Fowler Sr. – Absent
 - Garcias – Aye
 - Harrison - Absent
 - Hassane – Aye
 - Hodges – Aye
 - Ismaeil – Aye
 - Khoury – Aye
 - Murray Ramirez – Absent
 - Nash – Aye
 - Perlov - Nay
 - Roberts – Absent
 - Ruanto-Ramirez – Absent
 - Shah - Absent
 - Vance – Absent

 - Ayes: 9
 - Nays: 2
 - Abstain: 0

- Motion Fails.

- Vice-Chair Evans suggests all applicants be present during voting discussions. Asks how long applications are kept.
 - Mr. Strong: Clerk of the Board keeps applications for 1 year, then they expire.

Break – 5 min

- Commissioner Khoury nominates Adele Fassano, seconded by Commissioner Elliot-Santos.

- Commissioner Farouq asks Adele Fassano if she can explain the work she did with CBP and what she is most proud of?
 - Adele Fassano informs commission that she has been retired from CBP for 2 years and primarily focused on major field operations. Most proud of high standards and integrity. Shared more of what she did while working for CBP.
 - Commissioner Evans what does CBP mean?
 - Adele Fassano: Customs and Border Protection formerly Immigration.
 - Q: Evans - How long were these people detained?
 - A: Fassano - A long time.
 - Q: Evans – How does your background fold into what we are doing here if you are kind of on the opposite side?
 - A: Fassano – Through coalitions and outreach, has been nominated to serve on the Community Policing Advisory Board. Believes in solving problems together. Passionate about human rights.
 - Commissioner Hassane are you aware of the Friendship Park at the US/Mexico border? What do you think about it?
 - Adele Fassano: Is aware, does not agree with the closure. Would be a good resource on working with CBP to reopen park.
 - Chair Nash calls the Vote.
 - Vote:
 - Clark, C – Aye
 - Clark, K – Absent
 - De Los Rios - Absent
 - Elliot-Santos – Aye
 - Evans – Nay
 - Farouq – Nay
 - Fowler Sr. – Absent
 - Garcias – Aye
 - Harrison - Absent
 - Hassane – Aye
 - Hodges – Aye
 - Ismaeil – Aye
 - Khoury – Aye
 - Murray Ramirez – Absent
 - Nash – Aye
 - Perlov - Abstain
 - Roberts – Absent
 - Ruanto-Ramirez – Absent
 - Shah - Absent
 - Vance – Absent
 - Ayes: 8
 - Nays: 2
 - Abstain: 1
- Motion Fails.
- Commissioner Elliot-Santos motions to table item 5, seconded by Commissioner Khoury.
 - Vice-Chair will the people we vote on have an option to be voted on again?

- A: Mr. Strong – Yes.
- Chair Nash application period is still open.
 - Mr. Strong as long as it is at least 2 weeks prior to our meeting date to allow for review.
- Chair Nash are we allowed to review applications that came in after the deadline?
 - County Counsel: Needs to review and will report back.
- Chair Nash calls the Vote.
 - Vote:
 - Clark, C – Aye
 - Clark, K – Absent
 - De Los Rios - Absent
 - Elliot-Santos – Aye
 - Evans – Aye
 - Farouq – Aye
 - Fowler Sr. – Absent
 - Garcias – Aye
 - Harrison - Absent
 - Hassane – Aye
 - Hodges – Aye
 - Ismaeil – Aye
 - Khoury – Aye
 - Murray Ramirez – Absent
 - Nash – Aye
 - Perlov - Aye
 - Roberts – Absent
 - Ruanto-Ramirez – Absent
 - Shah - Absent
 - Vance – Absent
 - Ayes: 11
 - Nays: 0
 - Abstain: 0
- Motion passes.

6) Adjournment

- Meeting adjourned at 7:07pm